

ND-2016.12-E 282077

February 12, 2019

Jocelyn G. Boyd Chief Clerk/Administrator 101 Executive Center Dr., Suite 100 Columbia, SC 29201



Dear Jocelyn G. Boyd,

I am writing to provide information that may be of relevance to your department's metrics on Greenhouse Gas (GHG) emissions, renewable electricity penetration or renewable electricity delivery in your state.

I manage the Green-e Energy certification program, which is a consumer protection program that certifies sales of Renewable Energy Certificates (RECs)² and renewable electricity (collectively called "renewable MWh" for the purposes of this letter). Electricity users can purchase certified renewable MWh in order to voluntarily use more renewable electricity than they would otherwise receive through their electric utility service. Green-e Energy collects data on such voluntary renewable MWh purchases, and we are providing data to you to ensure that voluntarily-purchased renewables are not counted toward your state's Renewable Portfolio Standard, GHG reporting goals, or another conflicting obligation related to emissions or renewable electricity.

This letter serves to help you prevent double counting of renewable MWh by informing you of the quantity of electricity, which has been stripped of its RECs, that is generated or purchased by certain utilities. Electricity that is generated by a renewable electricity facility and has been separated from the RECs generated with it cannot be considered renewable electricity, because *RECs are the means to identify and claim which resource was used to generate renewable electricity*. Such electricity is commonly called "null power," and is typically treated as if it were power from the spot market because it cannot be linked back to a particular generation facility or resource type.

Utilities delivering this electricity without its RECs should not be allowed to count this electricity toward any state Renewable Portfolio Standards, mandates, disclosures of electricity delivered to customers that identify the generator's resource type, or the like; otherwise the RECs are considered double counted and are ineligible for separate sale. Similarly, when calculating emissions from electricity consumed in the state, electricity stripped of RECs should not be considered zero or low-emissions.

 $^{^2}$ RECs are tradable commodities that are used to track and allocate the use of renewable electricity in the US. RECs represent the environmental attributes of 1 MWh of electricity generated from a renewable resource, including the fact that the electricity produced low or no CO_2 emissions.

See the details below for the quantity and generation period of RECs sold separately from electricity that was generated or purchased by utilities in your state. Each utility's oversight body is being contacted with this information as well.

Transaction Details for Sales made in 2017

Çeneration Facility Name	Number of 'ŘĒČs (MWh) 'Šold Separately ' from Electricity	Generation Facility State	Renewable Resource Type	Period of Ğeneration (Quarter/Year ör Month/Year)	Null Power Purchaser in Your State
Town of Warsaw	348	NC	Solar	4/2017, 5/2017, 6/2017	Duke Energy Progress
r TWE New-Bern Solar Project, LLC	- 5 <u>214</u>	NC	Solar	1/2017, 10/2016, 11/2016, 12/2016, 2/2017, 3/2017, 4/2017, 5/2017, 6/2017, 8/2016, 9/2016	Duke Energy Progress
West Siler Farm Llc	4923	NC	Solar	1/2017, 2/2017, 3/2017, 4/2017, 5/2017, 6/2017	Duke Energy Progress
Bearford Farm Solar Project	4702	NC	Solar	2/2017, 3/2017, 4/2017, 5/2017, 6/2017	Duke Energy Progress
Bunn Level	2937	NC	Solar	4/2017, 5/2017, 6/2017	Duke Energy Progress
Cohen Farm Solar	7185	NC	Solar	1/2017, 10/2016, 11/2016, 12/2016, 2/2017, 3/2017, 4/2017, 5/2017, 6/2017, 8/2016, 9/2016	Duke Energy Progress
Deep Branch Project	341	NC .==	Soląr	1/2017, 6/2017	Duke Energy Progress
Delco	2712	NC	Solar	4/2017, 5/2017, 6/2017	Duke Energy Progress
Exum Solar Farm	4908	NC	Solar	1/2017, 12/2016, 2/2017, 3/2017, 4/2017, 5/2017, 6/2017	Duke Energy Progress
Floyd Solar, LLC	1850	NC	Solar	5/2017, 6/2017, 7/2016	Duke Energy Progress
Franklinton Solar	2650	NC	Solar	3/2017, 4/2017, 5/2017, 6/2017	Duke Energy Progress

United France	F220	NC	C-1	1/2017 2/2017	Dules Francis Description
Hector Farm Project	5228	NC	Solar	1/2017, 2/2017, 3/2017, 4/2017,	Duke Energy Progress
La caractica Cala	4227	NC	C-1	5/2017, 6/2017	Dula Franci December
Innovative Solar 65	4237	NC	Solar	1/2017, 12/2016, 2/2017, 3/2017,	Duke Energy Progress
65				4/2017, 5/2017,	
				6/2017, 5/2017,	
Kennedy Solar	1027	NC	Solar	4/2017, 5/2017,	Duke Energy Progress
Kerifledy Solar	1027	INC	Solal	6/2017	Duke Ellergy Flogress
Kojak	2810	NC	Solar	4/2017, 5/2017,	Duke Energy Progress
				6/2017	0, 0
Lanier Solar, LLC	7986	NC	Solar	1/2017, 10/2016,	Duke Energy Progress
				11/2016, 12/2016,	
				2/20 <u>1</u> 7 <u>,</u> 3/2017,	" مستد جدی شعری ا
<u> حضائد ہے۔ ہیں جمہد</u> ہ یہ حصنائی <u>ں۔۔۔</u>		. ڪ _ي ثيث		4/2017, 5/2017,	
				6/2017, 8/2016,	
				9/2016	
Maxton Solar 1	38	NC	Solar	9/2016	Duke Energy Progress
Meriwether	2589	NC	Solar	4/2017, 5/2017,	Duke Energy Progress
				6/2017	
Mills Anson	2756	NC	Solar	4/2017, 5/2017,	Duke Energy Progress
		:		6/2017	
Old Wire	3139	NC	Solar	4/2017, 5/2017,	Duke Energy Progress
		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	<u> </u>	6/2017	
Pollocksville	491	NC	Solar	1/2017, 12/2016,	Duke Energy Progress
Solar				2/2017, 3/2017,	
				4/2017, 5/2017,	
	7406	110		6/2017	D 1 - F D
South Louisburg,	7196	NC	Solar	1/2017, 10/2016,	Duke Energy Progress
LLC				11/2016, 12/2016,	
				2/2017, 3/2017,	
				4/2017, 5/2017,	
				6/2017, 8/2016, 9/2016	
Southerland	2795	NC -	Sõlar	4/2017, 5/2017,	Duke Energy Progress
Southerland	2733	INC	Joiai	6/2017	Dake Elicity 1 Tobicss
Spring Valley	4237	NC	Solar	2/2017, 3/2017,	Duke Energy Progress
Farm 2	4237	110	30.0.	4/2017, 5/2017,	Dane Energy Fregress
1 47711 2				6/2017	
St. Pauls Solar	3252	NC	Solar	3/2017, 4/2017,	Duke Energy Progress
	- 			5/2017, 6/2017	
Stone	3004	NC	Solar	4/2017, 5/2017,	Duke Energy Progress
				6/2017	
Tart	2479	NC	solar	4/2017, 5/2017,	Duke Energy Progress
				6/2017	
Maiden PV1 - 1	7776	NC	Solar	1/2017, 10/2017,	Duke Energy Carolinas,
				11/2017, 12/2017,	LLC

	-			2/2017, 3/2017,	
				4/2017, 5/2017,	
				6/2017, 7/2017,	
				8/2017, 9/2017	
Maiden PV1 - 2	5916	NC	Solar	1/2017, 10/2017,	Duke Energy Carolinas,
Waldell VI - Z	3310	,,,,	30.0	11/2017, 12/2017,	LLC
				2/2017, 3/2017,	
				4/2017, 5/2017,	
				6/2017, 7/2017,	
				8/2017, 9/2017	<u> </u>
Maiden PV1 - 3	8023	NC	Solar	1/2017, 10/2017,	Duke Energy Carolinas,
				11/2017, 12/2017,	LLC
				2/2017, 3/2017,	
				4/2017, 5/2017,	
	. +	***		6/2017,7/2017,	, i
				8/2017, 9/2017	
Maiden PV1 - 4	5949	NC	Solar	1/2017, 10/2017,	Duke Energy Carolinas,
				11/2017, 12/2017,	LLC
				2/2017, 3/2017,	
	:			4/2017, 5/2017,	
				6/2017, 7/2017,	
				8/2017, 9/2017,	
Maidan DV4	F004	NIC	Solar		Duke Energy Carolinas,
Maiden PV1 - 5	5984	NC	Solar	1/2017, 10/2017,	
				11/2017, 12/2017,	LLC
				2/2017, 3/2017,	
				4/2017, 5/2017,	
				6/2017, 7/2017,	
				8/2017, 9/2017	
Maiden PV1 - 6	5931	NC	Solar	1/2017, 10/2017,	Duke Energy Carolinas,
				11/2017, 12/2017,	LLC
				2/2017, 3/2017,	
				4/2017, 5/2017,	
			1	6/2017, 7/2017,	
	!			8/2017, 9/2017	
Conover PV2	19611	NG:	Solar -	1/2017, 10/2017,	Duke Energy Carolinas,
DEL1	15011			11/2017, 12/2017,	LLC
				2/2017, 3/2017,	
				4/2017, 5/2017,	
				6/2017, 7/2017,	
C	40000	NC	Cala -	8/2017, 9/2017	Duka Enargy Carolinas
Conover PV2 -	19839	NC	Solar	1/2017, 10/2017,	Duke Energy Carolinas,
DEL2				11/2017, 12/2017,	LLC
			1	2/2017, 3/2017,	
				4/2017, 5/2017,	
				6/2017, 7/2017,	
				8/2017, 9/2017	

		T	т		
Claremont PV3 -	18748	NC	Solar	1/2017, 10/2017,	Duke Energy Carolinas,
DEL1				11/2017, 12/2017,	LLC
				2/2017, 3/2017,	
				4/2017, 5/2017,	
				6/2017, 7/2017,	
				8/2017, 9/2017	
Claremont PV3 -	17629	NC	Solar	1/2017, 10/2017,	Duke Energy Carolinas,
DEL2			1	11/2017, 12/2017,	LLC
				2/2017, 3/2017,	
				4/2017, 5/2017,	
				6/2017, 7/2017,	
				8/2017, 9/2017	
10MW fuel cell	71161	NC	Gaseous	1/2017, 10/2017,	Duke Energy Carolinas,
electric			Biomass	11/2017, 2/2017,	LLC
generating	1 2 2 2 2 2 2 2	P	T	3/2017, 4/2017,	
facility				5/2017, 6/2017,	
				7/2017, 8/2017,	
				9/2017	
Choco Solar	35	NC	Solar	7/2017	Duke Energy Progress
Moffett Solar 1	2631	SC	Solar	12/2017	South Carolina
		· 			Electric&Gas Company
Floyd Solar, LLC	4886	NC	Solar	10/2017, 11/2017,	Duke Energy Progress
				12/2017, 7/2017,	
				8/2017, 9/2017	
Lanier Solar, LLC	4731	NC	Solar	10/2017, 11/2017,	Duke Energy Progress
				12/2017, 7/2017,	
		<u> </u>		8/2017, 9/2017	
Maxton Solar 1	2172	NC	Solar	10/2017, 11/2017,	Duke Energy Progress
				12/2017	
TWE New Bern	669	NC	Solar	7/2017	Duke Energy Progress
Solar Project,	ļ				
LLC					
South Louisburg,	1670	NC	Solar	7/2017, 8/2017	Duke Energy Progress
LLC					
Cohen Farm	921	UC.	Solar	8/2017	Duke Energy Progress
Solar				1	
Domtar	226204	SC	Non-	Q1/2017, Q2/2017,	South Carolina Public
Marlboro Mill			gaseous	Q3/2016, Q4/2016	Service Authority
Biomass Power			Biomass		
Plant					

^{*}This data reflects the overall total generation from this facility during the designated quarter, and not necessarily the total amount that was sold into your state. Please contact the generator facility for specific information.

For information about the Green-e Energy certification program and its requirements, or to ask questions about how this letter is best used, see www.green-e.org/Energy or email us at verification@resource-solutions.org. The table above can be sent to you electronically upon request.

Sincerely,

Michael Leschke

Senior Manager, Certification Programs